

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

In Re: AUTOMOTIVE PARTS  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Master File No. 12-md-02311  
Honorable Marianne O. Battani

In Re: ALL AUTO PARTS CASES

2:12-md-02311-MOB-MKM

THIS RELATES TO:

All Dealership Actions

**DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO AUTO DEALER PLAINTIFF  
HOLZHAUER AUTO AND TRUCK SALES, INC.'S MOTION  
TO STAY CONSIDERATION OF HOLZHAUER'S OBJECTION  
TO MASTER ESSHAKI'S AUGUST 3, 2015 AMENDED RULING**

**CONCISE STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES PRESENTED**

1. Whether the Court should stay consideration of Auto Dealer Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc.'s ("Holzhauer") Objection to, and Motion to Modify, Special Master Esshaki's August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling now that the Special Master has ruled on Holzhauer's Motion To Withdraw?

**Answer:** No.

**STATEMENT OF CONTROLLING OR MOST APPROPRIATE AUTHORITIES**

**Rulings**

Order Granting Automobile Dealer Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc.'s Rule 21 Motion To Be Dropped as a Named Plaintiff and Proposed Class Representative (12-md-02311, ECF No. 1113) (September 29, 2015).

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<u>Page</u>
CONCISE STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES PRESENTED.....	i
STATEMENT OF CONTROLLING OR MOST APPROPRIATE AUTHORITIES.....	ii
ARGUMENT.....	1

## **ARGUMENT**

Since last March, Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc. (“Holzhauer”) has simply refused to comply with its discovery obligations, including by filing (in late August 2015) a motion seeking permission to withdraw from this litigation without meeting any of those obligations. The Special Master has now *twice* ordered Holzhauer to comply with its longstanding discovery obligations, regardless of whether it is permitted to withdraw, and yet Holzhauer still has not obeyed these orders. The first of these Orders was issued on August 3, the second on September 29. Holzhauer’s objection to the first of these Orders has been fully briefed and is ready for decision. Auto Dealers’ motion that the Court stay its disposition of that objection has been rendered moot by the Special Master’s September 29 Order and therefore should be denied.

In his August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling, the Special Master granted Defendant’s Motion to Compel, ruling that Holzhauer must comply with its long-standing discovery obligations under the Special Master’s Stipulated Orders of January 7, 2015 and May 12, 2015, even if Holzhauer were to move to withdraw as a class representative. On August 24, 2015, Holzhauer filed its objection to the Amended Ruling, arguing that the Special Master had abused his discretion in requiring Holzhauer to comply with its discovery obligations as a condition of withdrawal. The next day, Holzhauer filed a motion to withdraw under Fed. R. Civ. P. 21, arguing (directly contrary to the August 3 Amended Ruling) that doing so entitled Holzhauer to avoid its discovery obligations.

On September 21, 2015, Auto Dealers asked this Court to stay its ruling on Holzhauer’s objection to the Amended Ruling “until Special Master Esshaki rules on Holzhauer’s pending Rule 21 motion to withdraw.” (12-md-02311, ECF No. 1105 at 1.) On September 29, 2015, the Special Master ruled on Holzhauer’s Rule 21 Motion, specifically reaffirming his August 3 Order “requiring Holzhauer to comply with the January 7 and May 12, 2015 Stipulated Discovery Orders

prior to [its] withdrawal becoming effective.” Order Granting Automobile Dealer Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc.’s Rule 21 Motion To Be Dropped as a Named Plaintiff and Proposed Class Representative (12-md-02311, ECF No. 1113).

There is therefore no reason to further delay a ruling on Holzhauer’s Objection to, and Motion to Modify, the Special Master’s August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling. The Special Master now has ruled *twice* that Holzhauer must comply with the Special Master’s prior orders of January 7 and May 12, 2015, *both* of which Holzhauer had *stipulated* to in order to avoid pending motions to compel. To finally put an end to Holzhauer’s protracted delay in meeting its basic discovery obligations, Defendants respectfully request that the Court both (1) deny Holzhauer’s Motion To Stay as moot, and (2) deny Holzhauer’s fully-briefed objection to the Special Master’s August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling.

Respectfully submitted,

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Steven F. Cherry  
Steven F. Cherry  
David P. Donovan  
Patrick J. Carome  
Dyanne M. Griffith  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel.: (202) 663-6000  
Fax: (202) 663-6363  
steven.cherry@wilmerhale.com  
david.donovan@wilmerhale.com  
patrick.carome@wilmerhale.com  
dyanne.griffith@wilmerhale.com

*Attorneys for Defendants DENSO Corporation and DENSO International America, Inc.*

Steven M. Zarowny (P33362)

General Counsel  
DENSO International America, Inc.  
24777 Denso Drive  
Southfield, MI 48033  
Tel.: (248) 372-8252  
Fax: (248) 213-2551  
steve\_zarowny@denso-diam.com

*Attorney for Defendant DENSO International America, Inc.*

K&L GATES LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ William R. Jansen (w/consent)  
William R. Jansen (P36688)  
Michael G. Brady (P57331)  
Amanda M. Fielder (P70180)  
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP  
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700  
Southfield, MI 48075-1318  
Telephone: (248) 784-5000  
wjansen@wnj.com  
mbrady@wnj.com  
afielder@wnj.com

Michael Martinez  
Steven M. Kowal  
Lauren N. Norris  
Lauren B. Salins  
K&L GATES LLP  
70 W. Madison St., Suite 3100  
Chicago, IL 60602  
Telephone: (312) 807-4404  
Fax: (312) 827-8116  
michael.martinez@klgates.com  
steven.kowal@klgates.com  
lauren.norris@klgates.com  
lauren.salins@klgates.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Chiyoda Manufacturing Corporation and Chiyoda USA Corporation*

LANE POWELL PC

October 6, 2015

/s/ Larry S. Gangnes (w/consent)  
By: Larry S. Gangnes  
LANE POWELL PC  
U.S. Bank Centre  
1420 Fifth Ave., Suite 4200

P.O. Box 91302  
Seattle, WA 98111-9402  
Tel.: (206) 223-7000  
Fax: (206) 223-7107  
gangnesl@lanepowell.com

Craig D. Bachman  
Kenneth R. Davis II  
Darin M. Sands  
Masayuki Yamaguchi  
Peter D. Hawkes  
LANE POWELL PC  
MODA Tower  
601 SW Second Ave., Suite 2100  
Portland, OR 97204-3158  
Tel.: (503) 778-2100  
Fax: (503) 778-2200  
bachmanc@lanepowell.com  
davisk@lanepowell.com  
sandsd@lanepowell.com  
yamaguchim@lanepowell.com  
hawkesp@lanepowell.com

Richard D. Bisio (P30246)  
Ronald S. Nixon (P57117)  
KEMP KLEIN LAW FIRM  
201 W. Big Beaver, Suite 600  
Troy, MI 48084  
Tel.: (248) 528-1111  
Fax: (248) 528-5129  
richard.bisio@kkue.com  
ron.nixon@kkue.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Furukawa Electric Co., Ltd. and American Furukawa, Inc.*

PORTER WRIGHT MORRIS & ARTHUR LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Donald M. Barnes (w/consent)  
Donald M. Barnes  
Molly S. Crabtree  
Jay L. Levine  
PORTER WRIGHT MORRIS & ARTHUR LLP  
1900 K Street, NW, Ste. 1110  
Washington, DC 20006  
Tel.: (202) 778-3054  
Fax: (202) 778-3063  
dbarnes@porterwright.com  
mcrabtree@porterwright.com  
jlevine@porterwright.com

*Attorneys for Defendants G.S. Electech, Inc.,*

*G.S.W. Manufacturing, Inc., and G.S. Wiring Systems, Inc.*

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Michael F. Tubach (w/consent)  
Michael Tubach  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel.: (415) 984-8700  
Fax: (415) 984-8701  
Mtubach@omm.com

Michael R. Turco (P48705)  
BROOKS WILKINS SHARKEY & TURCO PLLC  
401 South Old Woodward, Suite 400  
Birmingham, MI 48009  
Tek.: (248) 971-1713  
Fax: (248) 971-1801  
turco@bwst-law.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Leoni Wiring Systems, Inc. and Leonische Holding, Inc.*

JENNER & BLOCK LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Terrence J. Truax (w/consent)  
Terrence J. Truax  
Charles B. Sklarsky  
Michael T. Brody  
Gabriel A. Fuentes  
Daniel T. Fenske  
JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
353 N. Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60654-3456  
ttruza@jenner.com  
csklarsky@jenner.com  
mbrody@jenner.com  
gfuentes@jenner.com  
defenske@jenner.com

Gary K. August  
Jamie J. Janisch  
ZAUSMER, AUGUST & CALDWELL, P.C.  
31700 Middlebelt Road, Suite 150  
Farmington Hills, MI 48334-2374  
gaugust@zacfirm.com

jjasnisch@zacfirm.com

*Counsel for Defendants Mitsubishi Electric Corporation, Mitsubishi Electric US Holdings, Inc., and Mitsubishi Electric Automotive America, Inc.*

BUTZEL LONG

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Sheldon H. Klein (w/consent)  
Sheldon H. Klein (P41062)  
David F. DuMouchel (P25658)  
BUTZEL LONG  
150 West Jefferson, Suite 100  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Tel.: (313) 225-7000  
Fax: (313) 225-7080  
sklein@butzel.com  
dumouchd@butzel.com

W. Todd Miller  
BAKER & MILLER PLLC  
2401 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20037  
Tel.: (202) 663-7820  
Fax: (202) 663-7849  
TMiller@bakerandmiller.com

*Attorneys for Defendants TRAM, Inc. and Tokai Rika Co., Ltd.*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on October 6, 2015, I caused the foregoing **DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO AUTO DEALER PLAINTIFF HOLZHAUER AUTO AND TRUCK SALES, INC.'S MOTION TO STAY CONSIDERATION OF HOLZHAUER'S OBJECTION TO MASTER ESSHAKI'S AUGUST 3, 2015 AMENDED RULING** to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

*/s/ Steven F. Cherry* \_\_\_\_\_

Steven F. Cherry  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE  
AND DORR LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Tel.: (202) 663-6000  
Fax: (202) 663-6363  
steven.cherry@wilmerhale.com

*Counsel for DENSO Corporation and DENSO International America, Inc.*